

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Architectural Review Committee
Meeting Minutes

Date: March 3, 2015

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8th
Floor New Orleans, Louisiana.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Adjourned: 5:00 p.m.

Members present: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting: Crystal Mitchell

Members Absent:

I. AGENDA

1. Approval of the minutes of the January ARC Meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Wayne Troyer

Seconded: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 925 Race Street

Application: Amendment to the original building permit issued to include modifications to design of rear accessory building at a single family residential building.

Motion: The ARC agreed a low, shed roof dormer would be appropriate for the proposed building. It should begin at a point at least 18" from the roof ridge and from each side. Wayne Troyer made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 1204 Pauline Street

Application: Reconstruction of building.

Motion: Wayne Troyer made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The building, however, should be raised above the BFE with a crawl space.

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

4. 4508 St. Claude Avenue

Application: Construct new two story, two family residential building.

Motion: The ARC agreed that "Design 2" is the more compatible of the schemes presented with its elegant proportions and nice verticality. However, the diverse materiality is problematic. In general, it was agreed that brick veneer construction is out of context for the immediate vicinity of the district. The design would be improved if the entire building were sheathed in weatherboards. If the applicant chooses to use the combination of materials presented, the weatherboards of the front elevation should extend the entire width with the masonry dying behind it. There is too much blank wall above the second floor windows. They should be raised 12-18 inches. The balcony windows and/or doors should extend to the floor. The windows should be separated by a distance that would allow a more traditional shutter arrangement. Wayne Troyer made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

18. 822 Poland Avenue

Application: Modifications to locations of windows on side elevations.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the modified locations of windows proposed is approvable with the exception of the first two windows on each side elevation which should remain in their historic locations. John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Wayne Troyer

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

6. 2530 Chartres Street

Application: Demolish 740 sf at rear of existing building and construct a new, two-story addition; appeal of ARC recommendations regarding partial enclosure of side gallery.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the space identified as "Mud Room" on the proposed addition should be opened as a porch and detailed to match the existing side gallery. Windows should also be added to the front elevation of the camelback addition.

Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time, Crystal Mitchell arrived.

5. 1717 Coliseum Street

Application: This item was withdrawn.

8. 2617 Chippewa Street

Application: General renovation, 2nd floor addition.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommended conceptual approval of the proposal with the following recommendations and the details to be worked out at the Staff level:

- The roof should be gable-end rather than hipped.
- An appropriately rectangular window (i.e. single sash to match existing dimensions) should be added to the at least the right side of the front gable end.

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer

Opposed:

Comments:

9. 3925 Burgundy Street

Application: Renovation of existing vacant building to multi-family residential.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to approve "Scheme B" with its clean lines and good proportions. It is the more a honest reconfiguration of the existing industrial building. It also responds well to the existing office building across the street. However, the ARC recommended adding the open top floor loggia that was part of "Scheme C". They did agree that the variation of windows shown in Scheme C adds visual interest to the composition. The ARC takes no official position on the height waiver that you are seeking. Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposed massing with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. However, the ARC requested a review of the design development and detailing.

Seconded: Wayne Troyer

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Wayne Troyer

Opposed: Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Comments:

10. 1201 St. Andrew Street

Application: New construction of a single family residential building.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the parapet should be taller and should extend further down the side elevations to the depth of the front porch. The diagonal siding of the dormers should be replaced with horizontal siding. The side lites of the front door should be reconfigured. A skirt board and water table should be added. The base of the front elevation should be enclosed with a masonry chain wall that should extend down the side elevations to the depth of the front porch. Please consult the Staff for assistance with appropriate detailing. John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 1425 LaHarpe Street

Application: Extensive renovation of single family residential building.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the second story addition should be accommodated by "extruding" the form of the rear portion upward, keeping the same gable pitch with a relatively low interior ceiling. The new gable should have weatherboards to match the existing. The existing horizontal beam element and engaged column should be maintained at front elevation of the rear portion of the building and does not need to be replicated at new gable. You should verify the relationship of the building to existing property lines so that you can correctly determine if there are any issues of code compliance that must be accommodated. The wood columns proposed should be changed to a double wood column with a brick base similar to the existing engaged column at the rear portion of the building. Ensure that all drawings of the existing and proposed are drawn accurately.

Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Crystal Mitchell

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell

Opposed:

Comments:

11. 2322 St. Thomas Street

Application: Demolition and selective salvage of existing building, and construction of new, two-story, 4267 sf, two-family residence.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend that the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the following recommendations and the details to be worked out at the Staff level:

- The header heights at the 1st floor should be increased to 9'-0".
- The windows at the 2nd floor should be 3'-0"x6'-0".
- The wider rear portion of the building should be narrowed so that it only one bay wider than the front portion.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell

Opposed:

Comments:

12. 2042 Prytania Street

Application: Alteration to front façade of a one story existing grocery store.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the proposed storefront redesign is successful. However, the joint between new construction at the existing balustrade needs further study which may result in the need to lower the parapet height. Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell

Opposed:

Comments:

15. 2039 Coliseum Street

Application: Front facade renovation only. Work includes demolition of the existing front porch beams, fascia, columns, railings and steps and the construction of a new front porch facade.

Motion: Although the ARC agreed that the reconfiguration of the front elevation of the building is appropriate, it should be more simply detailed. There should be no brackets or pediment. The columns should be box columns. They recommended exploratory demolition to determine historic details of windows and door trim. The two front stairs should remain. Wayne Troyer made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Crystal Mitchell

Result: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell

In favor:

Opposed:

Comments:

16. 602 Independence Street

Application: HDLC approval to construct new single story addition joining the existing house to a new two story addition at rear.

Motion: The ARC reiterated that the screening device on the Chartres Street elevation should be raised to that of the top of the breezeway. A parapet should be added to the third floor addition with the roof sloping behind it. The sconces should be eliminated, as well. It will be important that this building has correct masonry detailing.

Beth Jacob made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Wayne Troyer

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell

Opposed:

Comments:

17.2232 Constance Street

Application: Construct a 2766 sq ft 2-story two-family house.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the entablature was slightly too tall. The garage door located on the left side of the building should be eliminated. The stair should be moved to align with the bay structure of the building. The front porch should be supported by a stuccoed pier condition. The garage door should be pushed back behind the piers to align with the front wall of the building. Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Crystall Mitchell

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell

Opposed:

Comments:

20.5017 Dauphine Street

Application: New construction of a 1664 s.f. single family residential building.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the windows should be more vertically proportioned. The shutters should be paneled or louvered as opposed to batten shutters. The front door and stair should be moved to the side bay of the front elevation. This building should have four equally spaced box columns at the front porch. Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell

Opposed:

Comments:

14. 1510 Gov. Nicholls

Application: New construction of a 2-story single family residence.

Motion: Wayne Troyer made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell

Opposed:

Comments:

19.3419 Chartres Street

Application: Modifications to side porch installed incorrectly without CofA.

Motion: The ARC agreed that there should be at least 18'-0", the length required to park a vehicle beyond the front wall of the existing building. This may require that the front edge of the porch be moved farther back or at least reconfiguring the stair as recessed within the porch. The roof structure should be reconfigured so that it springs from a point below the building eave line with a shallower roof pitch. The proposed metal balcony rail at the side French door should be simplified to fit within the door opening. Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Crystal Mitchell

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell

Opposed:

Comments:

24. 1421 Josephine Street

Application: Modifications to decorative fence installed in deviation of approved drawings.

Motion: The ARC agreed that, although the concept of a highly decorative, Gothic Revival fence was appropriate at this site, the composite fence partially installed is not. The Committee recommended raising the masonry plinth up to 18" and eliminating the bottom rail element from the design. The top portion could be retained and mounted just above the top of the masonry. The center panel in the gate is appropriate but it should be reconfigured without the vertical elements below. The fence along the side property line should be simplified to match that of the fence of the adjacent property. The finials should be removed and the tops of the pickets ground to form pyramidal points. The heights of the fence posts will need to be shortened to accommodate the revised fence height. John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the recommendations of the ARC and the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell

Opposed:

Comments:

31. 2301-2329 Burgundy Street

Application: General renovation of three buildings, including installation of dormers with skylights or skylights at 2301 Burgundy St.

Motion: The ARC agreed the dormers are appropriate because their low profile does not break the line of the roof against the sky, but recommended the demising wall between the rooms be translucent. The ARC agreed the dormers are preferred to the skylight option, but if the skylight option is pursued, the spacing of the skylights should be regularized.

The ARC recommended the rooftop equipment cut out be made as small as possible and moved toward the rear of 2301 Burgundy St. to further minimize its view from the street. The ARC agreed it needs additional information regarding the changes to the 2nd floor addition at 2329 Burgundy St. and that it may be more appropriate to remove and replace the addition.

Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the recommendations of the ARC and the details to be worked out at the Staff level provided the changes to the 2nd floor addition of 2329 Burgundy St. return to ARC when they are more fully developed.

Seconded: Crystal Mitchell

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell

Opposed:

Comments:

32.1500 St. Charles Avenue

Application: Construction of a temporary parking lot and temporary fence enclosure.

Motion: The ARC agreed that it is not appropriate to encroach upon the public right-of-way at what is known as the "Parade Ground" with the proposed temporary parking lot or fence. The paving and fence should also not encroach within the drip line of the existing live oak trees. The lot and fence should be in line with that of the existing adjacent buildings. The Committee recommended designing the fence out of a less permanent material that would not have a lifespan longer than 1-1/2 or 2 years so that it cannot be misconstrued as permanent. They further recommended that it be designed with references to construction fencing.

John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the recommendations of the ARC and the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Crystall Mitchell

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell

Opposed:

Comments:

30.4301 St. Charles Avenue

Application: Installation of protective window coverings.

Motion: Beth Jacob made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the installation of the brushed aluminum laminated glass window coverings.

Seconded: Crystall Mitchell

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell

Opposed:

Comments:

27.421 Harmony Street

Application: Construct camelback addition.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the rear shed roof addition should be demolished and rebuilt along with the second story addition. The second floor addition should be moved to be even with the back wall. 2'-10" x 5'-0" windows should be used at second floor. These windows should align with windows below where possible. Windows located at the front of the second story addition, kitchen and baths should be half the size of the windows typical to that floor. Additionally, the second story front elevation windows should be spaced further apart. The decorative scrolls from front metal handrails should be removed, creating a simple metal picket handrail. Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell

Opposed:

Comments:

28.917 Race Street

Application: Renovation of building.

Motion: The ARC agreed that removal of windows on the west elevation is not appropriate. If that is necessary due to reconfiguration of the interior plan, you should add fixed shutters at that point within the existing openings. Wayne Troyer made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level

Seconded: Crystall Mitchell

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell

Opposed:

Comments:

33.1476 Magazine Street

Application: Construction of a new multi-story, multi-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC agreed the proposed Magazine Street elevation competes inappropriately with the historic architecture of the immediate neighborhood in form, context and materiality. The balconies along Race Street would be more successful if detailed to be thinner and more reductive. As designed they appear as an extension of the massing of the building and, as such, are inappropriate over the public right-of-way. The massing of the building should stop at the property line. If elements are to extend beyond, they should appear to be additive. This reconfiguration would also help to increase the apparent verticality of the entire elevation. The window head heights respond well to the context. The garage door material is too flat. It will be critical that these, and other, elements are detailed appropriately lending critical depth of reveal and cleanliness of line throughout. Wayne Troyer made a motion to defer this application for additional review.

Seconded: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell

Opposed:

Comments:

34.3106 St. Thomas Street

Application: Construct single-family residence on existing vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC made the following recommendations:

- The projection of the Hardi trim in detail 2/A511 should be reduced from 2" to 1". This is typical of all similar details. The sill depth will also need to be adjusted in relation from 3" to an 1-1/2".
- The depth of the material at the roof and sides needs to be drawn a consistent depth since it is the same material.
- The flashing depth in detail 4/A401 should be increased from 2" to 3" to match the corners.
- A detailed section through the ridges and transom bars needs to be provided.

Wayne Troyer made a motion to request that revised drawings incorporating the recommendations of the ARC be submitted for review by the staff.

Seconded: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell

Opposed:
Comments:

At this time, John Klingman left the meeting.

29.704 Josephine Street

Application: Construct a 2-story, 1600sf single family residential building.

Motion: The ARC expressed concern over the contextual appropriateness of the proposed front elevation. It is still rather "defensive" in nature. It would respond better to the immediate neighborhood if the line between materials on the front elevation was raised to that of the porch lintel of the adjacent building. The ARC noted that it may be necessary to add transoms to the openings in order to achieve a proportion similar to those in the surrounding context. There should also be some attention to the demarcation of a front door. This could be accommodated by the addition of a freestanding element that defines a "threshold" at the entrance to the porch. The ARC agreed that the area labeled "porch" would be more successful if elevated to match the interior floor height.

The ARC also expressed concern over the vast unprotected southern exposure of windows and doors. The second floor massing could be extended over the first floor providing cover while maintaining the concept of the design. Detailing of the various materials and edge conditions will be critical to the success of this design.

Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the massing of the proposal. However, they have requested an additional review of the design development and detailing.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell, Beth Jacob

Opposed:
Comments:

There being no further business to attend to, the meeting was adjourned.

